

Competence and Performance Appraisal on Job Satisfaction

Kartono¹, Ramlah Puji Astuti², Citra Faathir Widiana³

^{1), 2), 3)} Department of Management, Faculty of Economics, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati (UGJ), Cirebon City, West Java, Indonesia

Article Info

Volume 82

Page Number: 7201 - 7209

Publication Issue:

January-February 2020

Article History

Article Received: 18 May 2019

Revised: 14 July 2019

Accepted: 22 December 2019

Publication: 03 February 2020

Abstract:

This research is intended to investigate the effect of competence and performance appraisal variables on the job satisfaction variable of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. The population of this research is the employees at that company, consisting of 196 respondents, while the sample is 132 respondents, taken by using the Slovin formula. The respondents were selected by using the Stratified Random Sampling technique. The instrument of this research was the questionnaire, and the collected data were processed by using the path analysis technique. The results show that competence and performance appraisal have a positive and significant effect on job satisfaction by 60.4%. The rest of 39.6% of job satisfaction is affected by other factors outside the model of this research.

Keywords: competence, job satisfaction, performance appraisal.

I. INTRODUCTION

In this globalized era, we are currently facing ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) and experiencing a rise in information and technology in many aspects, especially in business. Competition is getting tight, and qualified human resources have been the prerequisite for success. The skilled human resources will enable a company to have an outstanding business plan (Edison:2017; Sutrisno:2017).

One of the things that can support success in winning a competition is the existence of job satisfaction among human resources owned by a company. Job satisfaction is a pleasing emotional behavior experienced by an employee when doing a particular job following his values. A satisfied employee will be motivated to keep working well in attaining organizational goals. Conversely, a dissatisfied one will make him lazy, have low performance, and may result in an irresponsible strike (Edison, 2017; Sinambela, 2017; Rivai, 2015; Bangun,2012; Sulasmi, 2016).

A satisfied employee will tend to improve his competence as an effort to accomplish his job well. Competence relates to education. Thus, the higher the education level is, the higher the competence will be. Besides, an employee with a high education level will possess good experiences and dedication and finally will have better performance (Deswarta, 2017; Sulasmi, 2016).

One of the problems at a regional public company, namely, (Perumda) Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City, is a lack of human resource qualification. This phenomenon can be indicated by the education level of most of its employees graduating from senior high school (SLTA). Only a small percentage of its employees having an undergraduate degree. Also, Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City conducts training, seminar, and workshop to improve the competence of its employees. However, those activities were not equally felt by all employees. Hence, there is a difference in competence between employees who attend those activities and those who do not.

The following table shows the educational background of the employees of Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City.

Table 1. Education Level of Employees of Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City

No	Education level	Number of employees	Percentage
1.	Master degree (S2)	7 persons	4%
2.	Undergraduate degree (S1)	48 persons	24%
3.	Diploma III (D3)	13 persons	7%
4.	Senior high school (SLTA)	78 persons	39%
5.	Junior high school (SLTP)	34 persons	17%
6.	Primary school (SD)	20 persons	10%
Total		200 persons	100 %

Source: Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City, 2018.

The table above shows that most of the employees graduated from the senior high school level (39%), followed by an undergraduate degree (24%). It is better if Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City has more employees who graduated from the undergraduate level. Thus, the firm performance is expected to improve, and the employees will be able to perform their tasks better.

Previous research (Sutija; 2017) states that competence positively and significantly affects the employees' job satisfaction of the Cirebon Municipal government office. Another study (Renyut et al.;2017) indicate that competence positively and significantly affects the job satisfaction of employees at the Maluku Governor office. Besides, (Yuhui et al.;2016) state that job appraisal positively affects job satisfaction at microfinance institutions in Ghana. Similar research has been conducted by (Ferdiane1,et al.;2018) state that performance appraisal significantly affects employee job satisfaction at Wringin Anom sugar mill. However, a different result was revealed by (Nugraha;2018), stating that competence does not significantly affect employee job satisfaction at Perusahaan Industri Batamindo Investment

Cakrawala di Batam. Another result also shows that competence does not significantly affect employee job satisfaction at Kementrian Industri Republik Indonesia (Hairuddin et al.;2017).

Base on the phenomena outlined earlier, this research aims to:

1. Analyze the effect of competence on employee job satisfaction at Perusahaan Umum Daerah Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City.
2. Analyze the effect of performance appraisal on employee job satisfaction at Perusahaan Umum Daerah Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City.
3. Analyze the effect of competence and performance appraisal on employee job satisfaction at Perusahaan Umum Daerah Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Competence

Competence has an essential role in ensuring the sustainability of companies in achieving their goals. Companies need to pay close attention to their human resources so they will be highly competent. Highly skilled human resources are promising investment in achieving the vision and missions.

Competence is a fundamental characteristic owned by someone, which directly affects his performance (Sedarmayanti, 2017:150). Furthermore (Rande 2016:102) explains that competence is a combination of knowledge, skill, and behavior that must be possessed, comprehended, mastered, and actualized by employees in doing their professional work. Competence can also be defined as an ability to do a job or task based on skill and knowledge, supported by work behavior required by that job (Renyut et al. 2017:20). The followings are the dimensions of competence (Renyut et al. 2017) :

1. Knowledge

Knowledgeability relates to the theoretical or non-theoretical aspects of conducting a job. Besides, it also refers to the willingness to improve the quality of the work standard owned.

2. Skill

Employees must have skills related to their job and conduct their works optimally. Besides, they must be responsible for their work in increasing the quality of firm performance as a whole.

3. Mastery

This mastery aspect relates to the willingness to attend courses or training related to the employee's job. By having this mastery aspect, an employee will comprehend every theory delivered to him. Thus, he will master his job.

4. Professionalism

Professionalism relates to the fulfillment of tasks and responsibility as well as the commitment to the company.

5. Experience

Experience relates to the period of work in a particular position. An experienced employee will utilize his previous experience in conducting his current job.

Meanwhile, Purnomo (2016:4) states that competence is a human characteristic related to the effectiveness in achieving a work performance. This characteristic can be seen from styles in action, behavior, and mindset. Competence is a combination of knowledge, ability, and implementation in conducting a task in real work (Manik and Syafrina 2018:3).

Based on those explanations, it can be summarized that competence is an employee characteristic consisting of skill, knowledge, expertise, behavior, and willingness, which can affect superiority in creating productive work results. Hence, competence will finally affect the professionalism of an employee in achieving his working goals.

B. Performance Appraisal

Performance appraisal is a process in assessing the work result of somebody by using performance appraisal instruments by comparing the result with the standard. Through this performance appraisal, a company will be able to identify whether

a work result has followed the job description outlined earlier or not Asep Tapip Yani, (2018:54). Furthermore, Yuhui et al, (2016:282) state that performance appraisal is a motivation in growing loyalty, improving teamwork, affecting other human resource functions, and giving working motivation in general. Performance appraisal can become a reference in setting promotion, providing training and education, and granting bonuses or incentives to the employees (Hutagaol, 2016:250).

Performance appraisal assumes that employees understand their working standards. Thus, a company should provide an adequate response, development programs, and incentives as a mechanism in removing unwanted work results and motivating employees to show much better work performance (Rani, 2016:165).

Besides, (Yuhui et al. 2016:287) enlighten that performance appraisal can be conducted by seeing several aspects, as follows:

1. Fairness

It means the employees obtain fair treatment and rewards from the efforts they have made for the company.

2. Promotion

It relates to the opportunity to get a better position and higher income.

3. Feedback or response

Employees should get an explanation regarding their job so they can finish their job well. Besides, feedback will support employees in conducting their tasks.

4. Clarification of Working Role

It relates to the information regarding the functions or roles in each position. Employees should be provided an adequate explanation of the things they have to do.

From those explanations, it can be summarized that performance appraisal is a reference in giving promotion, training, education, bonuses, and incentives to the employees. Performance appraisal can be utilized to measure employees' loyalty and to

motivate employees so that they will have a better performance.

C. Job Satisfaction

Job satisfaction is a complex emotional reaction. An emotional reaction is a result of motivation, desire, requirement, and expectations of employees to their job, related to the perceived realities. Thus, an emotional reaction will be formed, reflected by happiness, satisfaction, or dissatisfaction (Sutrisno 2017:74). Job satisfaction can be stated as someone's feeling on his job, resulted from his effort (internal) and supported by external factors regarding working conditions, output, and the job itself (Sinambela, 2017:303).

Hasibuan, (2017:202) states that job satisfaction must be well created so employees will have higher morality, dedication, affection, and discipline to their job. Job satisfaction is a pleasing emotional behavior and a feeling of loving the job. This behavior is reflected in morality at work, discipline, and work performance. Job satisfaction can be felt within the work, outside the work, or a combination of these two. Zainal (2015:620) states that job satisfaction is fundamentally an individual characteristic. Each individual has a different level of job satisfaction under the adhered values within himself. The higher the appropriateness of activity to this expectation is, the higher the job satisfaction becomes. Furthermore, (Hasbie 2016:82) opinions that job satisfaction is a positive (pleasing) or negative (displeasing) emotion of somebody to his work. Each individual has a different level of satisfaction, under the prevailing value system within himself. The higher the compatibility of a job to his preference is, the higher the satisfaction level will be (Potale, 2015:65). Meanwhile, (Lodjo 2013:751) explains that job satisfaction occurs if the needs of an individual have been fulfilled, and it relates to the likeliness of that person to his job. Job satisfaction is closely associated with the rewards that will be obtained after making sacrifices in doing a job.

Based on the opinions of those researchers, it can be summarized that job satisfaction is different, following the prevailing system value within somebody consisting of affection to a particular job or work.

Job satisfaction relates to someone's feeling of a job as well as its aspects. A company must pay these aspects attention in understanding the satisfaction level of its employees and these can be categorized based on the focus of employees or the company.

Zainal (2015:623) explains that there are two dimensions of satisfaction, namely:

1. Human

In the perspective of humanity, every human has the right to be treated fairly and respectably. Job satisfaction is an extension of a good treatment reflection. A company must pay close attention to the emotional indicators or psychological health.

2. Benefit perspective

Job satisfaction can create a behavior affecting a company's functions, such as job content, salary, financial benefit, and working conditions.

Based on those explanations, in this study, we formulate the following hypothesis:

- H1 : Competence significantly affects the job satisfaction
- H2 : Performance appraisal partially affects the job satisfaction
- H3 : Competence and performance appraisal simultaneously affect job satisfaction

III. RESEARCH METHODS

This research used an associative method in exploring and analyzing the effect or relationship of two variables. In this study, we observed the impact of competence and performance appraisal on job satisfaction. (Sugiyono 2018:37) explains that problem formulation of an associative research deals with asking the relationship between two or more variables. The population of this study was employees at Perusahaan Daerah (Perumda) Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon consisting of 196

employees. Using a Stratified Random Sampling, we used 132 employees as the sample of this research. The data analysis in this study used regression analysis for measuring the relationship degree of two variables or more. Besides, we estimate the relationship direction of the independent variables on the dependent variable (Ghazali 2016:94).

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

D. Respondent Characteristics

The 132 respondents of this study are characterized based on their sex, age, latest education, and working duration. These data are shown as follows:

Table 2. Respondent Characteristics

Category	Criteria	Frequency (F)	Percentage (%)
Sex	Male	101	77%
	Female	31	23%
Age	<25 years	15	11%
	26-35	44	33%
	36-45	37	28%
	>46	36	27%
Latest education	Master's degree (S2)	5	4%
	Bachelor's degree (S1)	41	31%
	Diploma III (DIII)	10	8%
	Senior High School (SLTA)	76	58%
	Junior High School (SLTP)	5	4%
Working duration	< 5 years	7	5%
	6-10 years	9	7%
	11-15 years	15	11%
	16-20 years	57	43%
	21 years	44	33%

Source: processed data, 2019

Table 2 shows that most of the respondents of this study are male, consisting of 101 employees (77%). The number of the female respondent is 31 employees (23%). Most of the respondents are aged

25-35 years old (33%). In terms of educational background, most respondents are senior high school graduates of 76 employees (58%). Besides, we find that most respondents have a quite higher working duration of 16-20 years (43%).

E. Test of Instruments

A reliability test can be used to identify the robustness of instruments. The robust instruments will show a similar result in continuously-conducted and time-different tests. An instrument is reliable if its Cronbach Alpha value is more than 0.70. The following is the reliability test result.

Table 3. Reliability test result

Variable	Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
Competence	.820	13
Performance appraisal	.820	9
Job satisfaction	.808	7

Source: processed data, 2019

Based on the reliability test, it is shown that Cronbach's Alpha value of competence, performance appraisal, and job satisfaction variables are 0.820, 0.820, and 0.808, respectively. All those values are more than 0.70. Hence, all variables in this present study are valid.

F. Statistical Results

In identifying the effect of competence variable and performance appraisal on job satisfaction, we can use the following table:

Table 4. Coefficients

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients	Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
1 (Constant)	4.425		2.710	.008
Competence	.337	.602	7.827	.000

Performance appraisal	.166	.055	.231	3.010	.003
-----------------------	------	------	------	-------	------

a. Dependent Variable: Job satisfaction

Based on the table above, we can see that the regression coefficient of the competence variable is 0.337. This positive value means that there is a positive relationship between competence and job satisfaction. Besides, the coefficient of performance appraisal is also 0.166, meaning that there is also a positive relationship between performance appraisal and job satisfaction.

Table 5. Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.781 ^a	.610	.604	1.771

a. Predictors: (Constant), performance appraisal, competence

b. Dependent Variable: job satisfaction

Based on the table above, we can see that the value of the determination coefficient or R^2 (Adjusted R Square) is 0.604. It means the variables of competence and performance appraisal simultaneously affect job satisfaction by 60.4%. The rest of 39.6% of job satisfaction is influenced by other variables or factors outside this study.

In identifying the significance of competence and performance appraisal variables on job satisfaction partially, we can see Table 4. Based on this table, the Sig. value of competence is 0.000, lower than 0.05. It means there is a significant influence of competence on job satisfaction. Furthermore, Sig. value of the job appraisal variable is 0.003, also lower than 0.05. Hence, it can be stated that there is a significant effect of the performance appraisal variable on job satisfaction of employees.

In identifying the simultaneous effect of competence and performance appraisal on job satisfaction, we can see the ANOVA Table as follows

Table 6. ANOVA

Model	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	632.192	2	316.096	100.798	.000 ^b
Residual	404.535	129	3.136		
Total	1036.727	131			

a. Dependent Variable: job satisfaction

b. Predictors: (Constant), performance appraisal, competence

Source: processed data, 2019

Based on the table above, we can see that the Sig value is 0.000, lower than 0.005. We can, therefore, conclude that competence and performance appraisal variables simultaneously affect job satisfaction of employees.

G. Discussion

The discussion in this study covers two independent variables (competence and performance appraisal) and one dependent variable (job satisfaction). The explanations of these three variables are as follows:

1) The effect of competence on job satisfaction

Based on the result of the first hypothesis testing regarding the effect of competence on job satisfaction, it is shown that the t-calculated value is 13.465, larger than the t-table of 1.97838. Besides, the Sig. value is lower than Alpha of 0.05 (0.000 < 0.05). It means that H_a is accepted. Therefore, competence positively and significantly affects the job satisfaction of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. Competence is essential in creating job satisfaction of employees in the process of attaining organizational goals. A high

level of competence among the employees will create a high level of job satisfaction.

The result of this study is in line with (Sutija;2017) studying the effect of competence on job satisfaction of employees at Cirebon city government office. He states that competence positively and significantly affects job satisfaction at that institution. Besides, the result of our research supports (Renyut, et al;2017), studying the effect of organizational commitment and competence on job satisfaction at the governor office of Maluku province. They state that competence also positively and significantly affects job satisfaction.

Based on our study, however, we find that the competence of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City should be improved. It can be seen from the fact that of the 132 respondents in this study, the lowest average score is in point 13, regarding working experience in getting knowledge. Hence, job satisfaction is relatively lower.

Our evaluations regarding the competence at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City indicate that there are still several drawbacks. These include the inappropriateness of educational background in certain positions, low initiative among employees, and a relatively low level of employee knowledge. Those downsides result in less optimum employees' competence. Thus, their satisfaction level will also be weak.

2) *The effect of job appraisal on job satisfaction*

Based on the result of the second hypothesis testing about the influence of performance appraisal on job satisfaction, it is revealed that the t-calculated value is 9.792, larger than the t-table of 1.97838. Besides, the Sig. value is lower than Alpha of 0.05 ($0.000 < 0.05$). It means that H_a is accepted. Thus, performance appraisal positively and significantly affects the job satisfaction of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. Understandably, a fair and appropriate performance appraisal will result in a sensible expectation of employees, under the condition of an organization.

Consequently, employees' job satisfaction will also increase.

The result of this present study is in line with (Wahjono;2017), exploring the effect of performance appraisal on job satisfaction at a state-owned enterprise. He states that performance appraisal significantly and positively affects job satisfaction at those companies. Besides, the result of this study supports (Yuhui,et al. ; 2016), studying the effect of job appraisal on job satisfaction at microfinance institutions in Ghana. They conclude that performance appraisal significantly and positively influences job satisfaction of employees at those microfinance entities.

Performance appraisal at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City, however, needs to be improved. Based on the result of questionnaire distribution, we find that the lowest average score regarding this aspect is in number 2, regarding the bias appraisal practices. These will make employees feel demotivated because they are mistreated. As a consequence, their job satisfaction also decreases.

Based on our evaluation, the practice of job appraisal still has several weaknesses. These include the employees who do not obey regulations, and there are sanctioned employees so they cannot go to a higher position. Those shortcomings result in less optimum performance appraisal practices and decrease job satisfaction among the employees.

3) *The effect of competence and performance appraisal on job satisfaction*

Based on data in F-test, it is shown that the F-calculated value is 100.798, larger than F-table of 3.24. Besides, the Sig. value of 0.000 is also smaller than 0.05 ($0.000 < 0.05$). It means that simultaneously the competence and performance appraisal variables have a positive and significant effect on job satisfaction.

This result is in line with (Sinambela 2017:304), stating that the outcome received by an employee is under his expectation and education level, which can support his work for getting job satisfaction. Our evaluation indicates that Perumda

Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City still has several weaknesses regarding competence and performance appraisal practices. Hence, those issues affect the job satisfaction of the employees.

V. CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATION

Based on the result of this present study, we can conclude that competence positively and significantly affects the job satisfaction of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. It means the higher the level of competence is, the higher the level of job satisfaction becomes.

Performance appraisal also has a positive and significant influence on job satisfaction of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. It means, the better the performance appraisal is, the higher the level of job satisfaction becomes.

Simultaneously, competence and job appraisal have a significant and positive effect on job satisfaction of employees at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Giri Nata Cirebon City. It indicates that the better the competence of employees and performance appraisal are, the higher the level of job satisfaction will be.

Employees' competence should be improved by providing training and opening opportunities for employees to move to a higher or better position under their educational background. Hence, their satisfaction level will finally also improve.

Performance appraisal is an essential factor for any organization, and it must be conducted by considering the ability and working outcomes of employees. Thus, they will have a feeling of being treated equally and be motivated to work maximally for the organization.

REFERENCES

1. Asep Tapip Yani. 2018. *Dasar-Dasar Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. edited by Oesep Kurniadi. Bandung: MG PUBLISHER (Anggota IKAPI).
2. Bangun, Wilson. 2012. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. edited by Tim Perti 1. Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga.
3. Deswarta. 2017. "Pengaruh Kompetensi Dan Motivasi Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Dan Kinerja Dosen." *Jurnal Valuta* 3(1):19–39.
4. Edison, Emron. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Strategi Dan Perubahan Dalam Rangka Meningkatkan Kinerja Pegawai Dan Organisasi*. Kedua. Bandung: ALFABETA, cv.
5. Frans Firsta Ferdiane1*, Sri Wahyu Lelly Hana Setyanti2, Sudaryanto2. 2018. "Penerapan Sistem Penilaian Kinerja Dengan Intervening." 6:45–50.
6. Ghazali, Imam. 2016. *Aplikasi Analisis Multivariate Dengan Program IBM SPSS 23*. Semarang: Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro.
7. Hairuddin, Arminas, Mursalim Umar Gani, Bahar Sinring, and Zaenal Arifin. 2017. "Motivation, Competence and Organizational Commitment's Effect on Lecturers' Job Satisfaction and Lecturers Performance." *IRA-International Journal of Management & Social Sciences (ISSN 2455-2267)* 6(3):419.
8. Hasbie, dkk. 2016. "Kepuasan Kerja, Komitmen Organisasi Dan Keinginan Berpindah: Studi Pada Karyawan Pahala Express Jatiasih Bekasi." 4(1):79–86.
9. Husna Saleem. 2015. "Impact of Fairness of Performance Appraisal on Motivation and Job Satisfaction in Banking Sector of Pakistan." *Journal of Basic and Applied Scientific Research* 4(2):16–20.
10. Lijan Poltak Sinambela. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. edited by Suryani dan restu Damayanti. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
11. Lodjo, Fernando S. 2013. "Pengaruh Pelatihan, Pemberdayaan Dan Efikasi Diri Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja." *Pengaruh Pelatihan, Pemberdayaan Dan Efikasi Diri Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja* 1(3):747–55.
12. Malayu S.P. Hasibuan. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Revisi. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
13. Mangkunegara, A. A. Anwar Prabu. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan*. edited by Susan Sandiasih. Bandung: PT REMAJA ROSDAKARYA.

14. Manik, Ester. 2014. "Pengaruh Kompetensi Dan Kompensasi Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Serta Implikasinya Terhadap Kinerja Paramesia Di Rumah Sakit Cibabat Kota Cimahi." 8(2):62–72.
15. Manik, Sudarmin and Nova Syafrina. 2018. "Pengaruh Kompetensi Terhadap Kinerja Dosen Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Ekonomi Riau." *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi Dan Bisnis* 15(1):1–6.
16. Nugraha, Widi. 2018. "Analisa Pengaruh Gaya Kepemimpinan , Kompetensi Dan Komunikasi Internal Atasan Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Karyawan Ditinjau Dari Metode Regresi Linear (Studi Empiris." *Jurnal Industri Kreatif* 2(1):87–96.
17. Potale, Rocky and Yantje Uhing. 2015. "Pengaruh Kompensasi Dan Stres Kerja Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Karyawan Pada Pt. Bank Sulut Cabang Utama Manado." *Pengaruh Kompensasi Dan... Jurnal EMBA* 633(1):63–73.
18. Prasasti, Febrina Aulia, M. Parulian Hutagaol, and M. Joko Affandi. 2016. "Pengaruh Penilaian Kinerja Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan." *Jurnal Aplikasi Bisnis Dan Manajemen* 2(3):248–57.
19. Purnomo, Djuma. 2016a. "Pengaruh Motivasi Dan Kompetensi Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Dan Dampaknya Pada Kinerja Karyawan." *Jurnal Lentera Bisnis* 5(ISSN 2252-9993):1–8.
20. Purnomo, Djuma. 2016b. "Pengaruh Motivasi Dan Kompetensi Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Dan Dampaknya Pada Kinerja Karyawan Politeknik Lp3I Bandung." *Jurnal Lentera Bisnis* 5(ISSN 2252-9993):1–8.
21. Rande, Dina. 2016. "Pengaruh Kompetensi Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Pada Dinas Perhubungan, Komunikasi Dan Informatika." *Katalogis* 4(2):101–9.
22. Rani, Dkk. 2016. "Pengaruh Penilaian Kinerja Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Dengan Motivasi Sebagai Variabel Moderasi." *Penilaian Kinerja* 3(2):1–6.
23. Renyut, Bernard C., H. Basri Modding, Jobhar Bima, and St Sukmawati. 2017. "The Effect of Organizational Commitment, Competence on Job Satisfaction and Employees Performance in Maluku Governor' s Office." *IOSR Journal of Business and Management* 19(11):18–29.
24. Sedarmayanti. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Reformasi Birokrasi Dan Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil*. Revisi. edited by Dinah Sumayyah. Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.
25. Sugiyono. 2018. *Metode Penelitian*. Bandung: ALFABETA, cv.
26. Sulasmi, Siti. 2016. "The Effects of Commitment, Competence, Work Satisfaction on Motivation, and Performance of Employees." *International Journal of Advanced Research* 3:378–96.
27. Sutija. 2017. "Pengaruh Kompetensi Dan Kompensasi Terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Pada Kinerja." *VIII(1)*:89–95.
28. Sutrisno, Edy. 2017. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Pertama. Jakarta: KENCANA.
29. Umar, Husein. 2014. *Metode Penelitian Untuk Skripsi Dan Tesis Bisnis*. Jakarta: PT. RAJAGRAFINDO PERSADA.
30. Veithzal Rivai Zainal, Dkk. 2015. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Untuk Perusahaan*. ketiga. Jakarta: PT. RAJAGRAFINDO PERSADA.
31. Wahjono, Sentot Imam and Anna Marina. 2017. "The Impact of Performance Appraisal on Job Satisfaction with Quality of Supervisor-Employee as a Moderating Variable at State Owned Company The Impact of Performance Appraisal on Job Satisfaction with Quality of Supervisor-Employee as a Moderating Variabl." (January).
32. Yuhui, Ge, Zipporah Aidoo, Ramous Agyare, Lavish Mensah, and Isaac Opoku Ansah. 2016. "The Impacts of Performance Appraisal on Employees' Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment: A Case of Microfinance Institutions in Ghana." *International Journal of Business and Management* 11(9):281.